

HIST 201.601 (S2016)
Religious & Political Tolerance, Then and Now

Van Pelt 302
M 6-9

Dr. Daniel Cheely
cheelyjm@sas.upenn.edu



Frans Hogenberg Engraving of "Massacre dans la Ville de Paris", c. 1572.

Course Description:

That John Locke's *Letter on Toleration* (1689) inaugurated a new era in which neighbors no longer had to kill each other for what they believed is a founding myth of modern, capitalist, liberal politics. How did minorities survive before then? This seminar will explore how groups that hated each other in principle got along in practice, from the political arrangements of the Roman Empire to the "convivencia" of Al-Andalus until the disaster of the Thirty Years War. By writing about the conditions of living together in the past, students will be prepared to consider the prospects for tolerance in the future. This seminar may be taken to fulfill the following requirements for Penn History Majors: Pre-1800, SEM, Europe, and Intellectual History Concentration.

Required Texts:

Almost of the readings for this course will be available both electronically and by **bulkpack**. Those posted on our course Canvas site will be marked (C).

The following books should be acquired. You may purchase them on your own (amazon, bookstore, etc) or you may borrow them. The university's borrowing systems (Borrow-Direct, EZ-Borrow, and Inter-Library Loan) will be a particularly cost-efficient way to obtain these books, as long as you request them with sufficient time in advance (see the schedule of readings below).

1. *Princeton Readings on Religion and Violence* (2011)
2. Andrew Murphy, *Conscience & Community* (2001)
3. David Nirenberg, *Communities of Violence* (2015)

Overview of Assignments:

Participation:

(a) Submitting Questions on Canvas by Saturday night. Either one question per reading or two questions that engage multiple readings.

(b) Discussion Leader: Groups together questions, proposes ways of answering them, identifies advantages and disadvantages to those approaches.

(c) Tolerance in the News: Student leader brings in one-page news item somehow related to tolerance for the entire class to review. Student leader opens the second half of the seminar (after the coffee break) with a ten-minute discussion of how this news item and its coverage engages the themes discussed in the class.

(d) Concluding discussion: Student summarizes the points of agreement and disagreement and the promising ways forward as each class ends. Adds relevant dates to class timeline.

Database: Compile, organize, and annotate passages from the Bible, Qur'an, and Bhagavad Gita that relate to relations between insiders outsiders, force and passivity, violence and peace. **Due 2/1**

Historicist Report (5-6pp): Choose one of the passages from your database and explain how its meaning was interpreted in at least two different contexts. What conclusions can the study of these two contexts lead you to draw about the relationship between revelation and violence? **Due 4/11**

Final Project

Essay (7-8pp): Analyze one contemporary issue for which the principle of tolerance has been invoked or, in your judgment, should be invoked. With the set of methods, questions, and conclusions derived from this course, discuss this issue in relation to (a) the history of toleration and (b) theories about toleration and the common good. **Due 5/10**

OR

Final Exam: Summative in-class assessment on the Past & Future of Tolerance.

Grade Distributions:

Participation & Presentations: 30%

Database & Report: 30%

Final Project: 40%

Seminar Policies:

Tolerance in the classroom: This seminar invites all its members to engage in a robust and lively exchange of ideas. It also requests that participants seek to empathize with those who propose ideas – that is, with every person who inhabits our academic community. To that end, we follow the general rules of civil discourse, knowing still that respect is a virtue to be cultivated more than a policy to be enforced.

Attendance is required. Every student is an integral part of the learning that happens through a seminar. Unlike lectures, seminars are weakened by the absence of even a single student.

Students who miss a seminar must make a reasonable effort to contact me in advance. No later than their return to class, students must report the absence and the reason it occurred using the Course Absence Report system (CAR) in Penn-In-Touch.

The following are regarded as excused absences:

1. Absences resulting from religious holidays.
2. Absences resulting from legal obligations, e.g., jury duty
3. Medical emergencies

A failure to provide an accurate account of an absence will be regarded as a violation of academic integrity and will be reported to the Office of Student Conduct. Regardless of the reason for absence, students are responsible for determining what was learned in their absence. Students who anticipate missing class should contact me ahead of time, just as they should make arrangements to meet with me immediately upon returning from an absence.

Attendance includes being present in the class, including refraining from using tech devices for non-class-related purposes. Attention affects participation, which in turn affects the participation grade.

A late assignment will drop one full grade each day it is late. Extension requests must be submitted twenty-four hours before the deadline to be considered. Please aim to complete your assignment, therefore, at least twenty-four hours early.

Each seminar begins promptly at 6pm. All students are expected to be present and ready to participate by that time.

Honesty is fundamental to the whole project of a university. Since learning ultimately depends upon trust, the scope of academic honesty is far greater than the notorious infractions outlined in the Penn Code of Academic Integrity. The Code sets the minimum standards, violations of which cannot be *tolerated*. Please review the Code here:

http://www.upenn.edu/academicintegrity/ai_codeofacademicintegrity.html

Students with Disabilities are welcome. Please let me know if you anticipate any issues that might affect your performance in the class (perhaps related to format and policies), or if you have emergency medical information you wish to share.

If you require disability-related accommodations, please register with the Office of Disability Services (ODS). Disabilities may include learning, psychiatric, or physical disabilities. ODS can assist you with finding out if you qualify for Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accommodations.

*Office of Disability Services
Stouffer Commons, Suite 300
3702 Spruce Street*

Phone: (215) 573.9235 Email: sds@mail@zimbra.upenn.edu

Monday-Friday, 9:00am to 5:00pm

For other UPenn resources for students with disabilities, visit

http://www.vpul.upenn.edu/lrc/sds/cs_resources.php

Calendar:

1. 1/13: Introduction: Tolerance & Modernity
 - John Rawls *Political Liberalism* (1993), xvi-xxx, 1-40, 190-195, 304-331. (C)
 - M. Juergensmeyer and M. Kitts, eds., *Princeton Readings in Religion and Violence [PRRV]* (2011), 1-12, 217-222 (C)
 - William Cavanaugh, *Myth of Religious Violence* (2009), 1-12, 123-180 (C)

2. 1/25: Ancient Empires until Constantine
 - Peter Garnsey, “Religious Toleration in Classical Antiquity” *SCH 21* (1984), 1-27. (C)
 - Primary: Porphyry (c.235-c.305), *Against the Christians* (C)
 - Primary: Passions of S. Perpetua & Felicity (3rd Century) (C)

3. 2/1: Revelation, Codes, and Roman Empire after Constantine
 - Search the Scriptures– finding toleration (or not) in Bhagavad Gita, Bible, & Qur’an
 - Laws: Edict of Milan (313), Julian’s Toleration Edict (362), Theodosian Code XVI (5th c.) (C)
 - Primary Texts: Augustine, *City of God*, selections from Books I-V, XV-XX (E-text & C); Augustine, Epistles on the Donatist Controversy

- Due: Database I, Presentation, and Cross-Examination:** Search the Scriptures (Bhagavad Gita, Bible, Qur’an)

4. 2/8: A Persecuting Society? Christendom
 - R.I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Authority and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250* (1st ed., 1987; 2nd ed., 2007), excerpts. (C)
 - John Christian Laursen and Cary Nederman, eds., *Beyond a Persecuting Society: Religious Toleration before the Enlightenment* (1998), 1-24. (C)
 - Jacques Fournier, *Inquisition Records* (1318-1325) (C)
 - John of Salisbury, *Policraticus*, selections

5. 2/15: An Interfaith Utopia? Dar al-Islam
 - Marc Cohen, “The Neo-Lachrymose Conception of Jewish-Arab History” (C)
 - Norman Stillman, “Myth, Countermyth, and Distortion” (C)
 - Bernard Lewis, *The Jews of Islam* (1984), 3-66 (C)
 - Early Islamic Legal Texts (C)
 - Cairo Geniza Docs about the poor and family life in the Muslim world (6.5, 6.7) (C)

- Maimonides “Letter on Apostasy” (11.6) (C)
6. 2/22: Finding Enemies without and within? Crusades and Expulsions
- Two Accounts of the Muslim Conquest of Iberia (C)
 - Two Accounts of the First Crusade (C)
 - *The Oxford History of the Crusades* (1995/9), 1-12, 66-90 (C)
 - Thomas Aquinas, “Whether it is always Sinful to Wage War?”, *Summa Theologica* (PRRV), 41-44 (C)
 - Charters and Letters on the Expulsions of Jews and Muslims (C)
 - Henry Kamen, “The Great Dispersion”, 1-26 in *The Spanish Inquisition* (C)
 - **Optional:** Marc Cohen, *Under Crescent and Cross*, 77-138 (C)
 - **Optional:** Jonathan Riley Smith, ‘Religious Violence’, *Religious Violence between Christians and Jews. Medieval Roots, Modern Perspectives*, ed A Sapir Abulafia, Basingstoke (Palgrave), 2002, pp 184-7. (C)
7. 2/29: Violence & Ritual: From Medieval to Early Modern
- Pre Reformation
 - David Nirenberg, *Communities of Violence*, selections (C)
 - Henri Hubert & Marcel Mauss, “Conclusion,” in *Sacrifice: Its Nature & Function* (PRRV), 108-114 (C)
 - René Girard, “Sacrifice” in *Violence and the Sacred* (PRRV), 127-140 (C)
 - Post-Reformation
 - Natalie Zemon Davis, “Rites of Violence” (C)
 - Jacques Auguste de Thou, *An Eyewitness Account of the St. Bartholomew’s Day Massacre* (C)

3/7 = SPRING BREAK = NO CLASS

8. 3/14: New Worlds of Difference
- Anthony Grafton, *New Worlds, Ancient Texts*, Ch 3: All Coherence Gone (C)
 - Thomas More, *Utopia* (1516), selections (C)
 - *Annals Cuauhtinchan* (c.1519) (C)
 - Sepulveda, *Just War in the Indies* (1547), selections (C)
 - Las Casas, *Defense of the Indians* (1552), selections (C)
 - **Optional:** Inga Clendinnen, *Aztecs: An Interpretation* (1991), selections (C)
 - **Optional:** Ibn Battuta, *Rihlah* (1325-1354), selections (C)

9. 3/21: Prosecuting Dissidents, Reforming Manners: Heretics, Rogues, and Witches
- Martin Luther, *Against the Robbing and Murdering Hordes of Peasants* (C)
 - Perth Consistory Records (C)
 - Marion Gibson, ed. *Early Modern Witches: Witchcraft Cases in Contemporary writing*, selections. (C)
 - Brad Gregory, “The Willingness to Kill” in *Salvation at Stake: Christian Martyrdom in Early Modern Europe* (Harvard, 1999), 74-96 (C)
 - Alexandra Walsham, *Charitable Hatred*, 1-20, 300-322 (C)
 - **Optional:** Ethan Shagan, *The Rule of Moderation: Violence, Religion and the Politics of Restraint in Early Modern England* (2011), 1-72, 326-341. (C)
10. 3/28: Modus Vivendi: Dutch Republic, Pennsylvania, Massachusetts Bay
- Andrew Murphy, *Conscience & Community*, selections (C)
 - Benjamin Kaplan, *Divided by Faith*, selections (C)
 - John Winthrop, “A Model of Christian Charity” (1630) (C)
 - Trial of Anne Hutchison (1630) (C)
 - Roger Williams, “Bloody Tenent of Persecution” (1644) (C)
 - **Optional:** Daniel Jutte, “Interfaith Encounters between Jews and Christians in the Early Modern Period and Beyond: Toward a Framework”, *AHR* (April 2013), 378-400 (C)
11. 4/4: States & Skeptics
- Richard Tuck, *Philosophy and Government, 1572-1651* (Cambridge, 1993), 31-64, 346-8 (C)
 - Sebastian Castellio, *Reply to Calvin in Concerning Heretics*, trans. Roland Bainton (New York, 1935), 281-282. (C)
 - Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*, Chapters 4-9, 12-14, 17-18, 21, 29-32, 37, 39-40 (E-Text)
12. 4/11: Toleration outside the Western Whig Tradition?
- John Christian Laursen, *Religious Toleration: The “Variety of Rites” from Cyrus to Defoe* (C)
 - Primary: PRRV: 13-28. (C)
 - Kautilya, “Forms of Treacherous Fights,” the Arthashastra
 - Sun Tzu, “Laying Plans,” *The Art of War*
 - Bhagavad Gita in the Mahabharata
 - Soho Takuan, “Annals of the Sword Taia”, *The Unfettered Mind*.

- **Optional Resources** listed on Canvas

Due: Database II & Historicist Report (5-6 pp.)

13. 4/18: “Birth of Toleration” in England: Between Liberalism and Consumerism?

- John Milton, *Areopagitica* (C)
- Toleration Act of 1689 (C)
- John Locke, *Letter on Toleration* (C)
- John Dunn, “The Claim to Freedom of Conscience: Freedom of Speech, Freedom of Thought, Freedom of Worship?” in O.P. Grell, Jonathan Israel, and Nicholas Tyacke, eds., *From Persecution to Toleration: The Glorious Revolution and Religion in England* (1991), 171-193. (C)
- Brad Gregory, “Manufacturing the Goods life”, in *The Unintended Reformation*, 235-297. (C)

14. 4/25: Rawls... and Post-Rawls?

- Russell Hittinger, Review of John Rawls’ *Political Liberalism*, in *Review of Metaphysics*. (C)
- Andrew Murphy, *Conscience & Community*, selections (C)
- Richard Rorty, “The Priority of Democracy to Philosophy” in *Objectivity, Relativism, and Truth: Philosophical Papers, Volume 1* (1990). (C)
- Alasdair MacIntyre, *Whose Justice? Which Rationality?* (Notre Dame, 1988), 1-11 (C)
- Eric Gregory, *Politics and the Order of Love: An Augustinian Ethic of Democratic Citizenship* (Chicago, 2008), selections. (C)
- Paul Griffiths and Jean Bethke Elshtain, “Proselytizing for Tolerance” (C)

Final Exam: The past and future of Tolerance

OR

5/10: Final Paper (7-8 pp.)